

Lima Historic Preservation Commission Year End Summary 2020

December 17, 2020

To: Supervisor Mike Falk and Lima Town Board Members
Mayor John Wadach and Lima Village Board Members

From: Historic Preservation Commission
Fran Gotcsik
Robin Hargrave
Don Brown (consultant)

We thank the Lima Town and Village Boards for their ongoing support of Lima's Historic Preservation Commission (HPC). We appreciate the boards' recognition of the value of Lima's historic architectural assets, and the opportunity to be of service to the community in their preservation.

Please let us know of others who may be interested in serving as we are eager to add members to the Commission.

Issues arose this year that underscored the importance of the HPC receiving the following

- **use of the proper permit application (building or signs),**
- **a proposal that has been reviewed to ensure it conforms to code,**
- **an Historical Preservation Commission Review Application that is fully completed and signed by the applicant.**

The HPC's review of several applications was delayed because it was unclear whether the request met code, applicants did not use the correct form, and/or applicants did not supply the information requested on the form.

LIMA HPC ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW REFERRALS

All referrals were received from Lima's Code Enforcement Officer. The HPC conducted its review of each referral by Zoom, email or phone, using the *Lima, NY Façade Renovation Guidelines, 2010* and the *Lima Village Zoning Code, Article V. Downtown Business District, Design Principles and Building Standards*, as a basis for its recommendations. Unfortunately, COVID-19 limited the HPC's ability to meet with property owners and collectively review projects on site as was customary in prior years. The HPC transmitted all its recommendations to the Code Enforcement Officer.

We have included a brief summary of the activities carried out by the HPC during 2020. Not all HPC recommendations were implemented as the HPC's role is only advisory.

1883 Rochester Street

A National Register-listed c. 1860s vernacular Greek Revival commercial building with three store fronts and residential apartments on the second floor located in, and a contributing member of, the Lima Village National Register Historic District and the Historic Overlay District. The building is significant for the role it played in commercial activity in the village. The request was for a 32” by 40” black sign with red logo and lettering at the front of the building for Jonnie B’s. At 8.8 sq. ft., the HPC responded that the proposed sign conformed to Lima’s design guidelines but noted that the application lacked information on location and lighting.

1893 Rochester Street

A National Register-listed c. 1860 one bay corner storefront in the Masonic/Lockington Block building located in, and a contributing member of, the Lima Village National Register Historic District and the Historic Overlay District. The HPC approved the existing (not previously reviewed) wall-mounted sign on the Rochester Street facade and two vinyl self-adhesive window signs, one on Main Street and the other on Rochester Street, for Walt Fritz’s physical therapy office. The HPC appreciated that Mr. Fritz printed paper signs of the approximate size as his proposed window decals to make it easier for the HPC to determine the eventual appearance of the signs.

7296 West Main Street

A two-story c. 1880 Queen Anne style brick commercial building located in the Lima Village Historic Overlay District. It is the only structure of this building style within the commercial core. The original cast iron storefront details confirm its 1880 date of construction.

The owners received approval for a Livingston County First Impressions Program Grant to install two new storefront windows. As part of the approval process, they were required to consult with Louise Wadsworth to assure that the materials proposed complied with Lima’s design guidelines. Ms. Wadsworth sought a review from the HPC as part of the consultation.

The HPC responded that the proposed change did not satisfy the intent of the Town and Village of Lima to “preserve and enhance the appearance and historical character of the building involved and those buildings in close proximity to historical buildings,” as stated in the Historical Preservation Commission Review Application nor did it meet Lima’s design guidelines. HPC offered a series of suggestions that would retain the original size and character of the window openings. HPC members Robin Hargrave and Don Brown also met on site with the owner on more than one occasion. The HPC is pleased that the owner chose to retain the original frames but replace the glass, as suggested by Don Brown. This proved to be a very satisfactory and economical solution.

7306 East Main Street

A two-story, three bay National Register-listed c. 1860 Greek Revival style brick commercial building located in, and a contributing member of, the Lima Village National Register Historic District and the Historic Overlay District. The building was constructed at the same time as and of similar design to the American Hotel to the west and the commercial building to the east at 7308 East Main. All three buildings were constructed after an 1858 fire destroyed the previous American Hotel and two commercial buildings.

The owners were seeking approval for a Livingston County First Impressions Program Grant to install a total of 12 upper level windows on the north, west, and south sides of the building as the present windows were deemed not energy efficient.. As part of the approval process, they were required to consult with Louise Wadsworth to assure that the materials being used complied with Lima's design guidelines. Ms. Wadsworth sought a review from the HPC as part of the consultation.

The HPC agreed to accept brown, aluminum-clad wood windows with 6 over 6 divided lights for the Main Street, front elevation. This acceptance was made provided that no white frames be used and that the frames and grids of any replacement windows be of the character and dimension of the historic windows found on the second-story of the American Hotel and the adjacent building at 7308 East Main.

On the west elevation, the HPC recommended that where there were original openings (distinguished by stone lintels and sills) the windows should be replaced with dark colored sash of design and proportion identical to the front replacement windows.

For the newer window openings on the west and south elevations, the HPC recommended that replacement windows also be dark colored sash and of a style with a frame of smaller dimension and more glass area than pictured in the illustration provided with the application.

PathStone

The Lima Joint Town and Village Planning Board identified the HPC as a potentially involved agency in the review of PathStone Corporation's application for site plan approval related to a proposed residential development on McDonald Drive in the Village. As the project is located within the Historic Overlay District, the planning board sought input from the HPC regarding potential impacts of the project.

The HPC submitted comments to PathStone, guided in part by the recommendations put forth in the 2013 Community Vision Plan, including the importance of

- thoughtful design for fostering civic pride
- creation of a unique identity that draws upon the historic character of the village
- prioritization of the needs of the pedestrian
- fostering connectivity and access to the Village Core
- attracting new and maintaining existing village residents.

In communications sent to PathStone on June 22, September 1, October 14, and December 17, the HPC submitted comments and recommendations on:

- residential and community building color, window and gable treatments, use of veneer knee walls, and overall design;
- lighting height and design;
- refuse areas;
- landscaping; and
- project name.

PathStone responded on August 14 and October 23 and agreed to many of the HPC's suggestions. PathStone also noted that they would consider other recommendations as an alternate that could be adopted if the budget allows.